

To: South Hero Select Board

From: New Town Hall Building Committee

Date: September 23, 2024

Subject: Recommendation for Architectural and Engineering Services for the New Town Hall

The New Town Hall Building Committee, established by the Select Board, is pleased to submit its recommendation for Architectural and Engineering services.

RFP Evaluation and Recommendation

The Request for Proposals (RFP) was issued on August 13, 2024. Six firms registered as interested parties, and four of those six firms submitted proposals. The firms that provided proposals to the RFP were: AES Northeast, Cross Consulting Engineers, Scott and Partners Architecture, and Wiemann Lamphere Architects.

All four proposals were reviewed by the committee. Due to a conflict of interest, two committee members, David Roy and Matt Reed, were unable to participate in the evaluation process. The remaining five committee members completed the reviews and are pleased to provide this recommendation.

Professional Services and Phase I Scope

The professional services to be provided include:

- Architectural Design
- Civil (Site) Engineering
- Landscape Architecture
- Structural Engineering
- Geotechnical Engineering
- Mechanical, Electrical, and Plumbing (MEP)
- Cost Estimating

The RFP was divided into two phases. The first phase is intended to guide us to the bond vote. To align with the regional planning grant, the committee capped "phase 1" expenses at \$20,000.

Proposal Comparison and Reconciliation

A summary of the costs provided by each responding architect is [attached](#). Please note that there were some differences in how firms presented their costs, such as the inclusion of landscape architecture or geotechnical services, and the method of estimating costs. To ensure a fair comparison, we reconciled these differences and calculated a reconciled total project fee. See [attached](#).

Committee Recommendation

The Committee felt that all four firms' proposals demonstrated a high degree of competence and experience. However, based on the reconciled total project fee, the firms' project portfolios, the thoroughness and attention to detail in their proposals, the committee has chosen to

recommend AES Northeast for Selectboard consideration.

Additional Recommendations:

- **Project Delivery Method:** The committee recommends the Design-Bid-Build delivery method to ensure competitive bidding.
- **Grant Exploration:** The committee recommends utilizing AES Northeast's grant research service to explore potential funding opportunities.

We believe that AES Northeast is well-suited to lead the design and construction of the new town hall and will provide excellent value to the South Hero community.

South Hero New Town Office - Architecture and Engineering Proposals - Listed alphabetically

| AES Northeast - Design Bid Build | | | | | | |
|----------------------------------|------------------|--------------------|------------------------|-------------------------------------|-----------------------|-------------------------------------|
| Service | Phase I Services | Phase II Services | | | | Total Phase I & Phase II by service |
| | Schematic Design | Design Development | Construction Documents | Bidding | Construction Admin | |
| Architectural Design | \$8,000 | \$14,000 | \$22,000 | \$8,000 | \$35,000 | \$87,000 |
| Civil (Site) Engineering | \$1,500 | \$10,000 | \$12,000 | \$1,000 | \$4,000 | \$28,500 |
| Landscape Architecture | \$0 | \$0 | \$0 | \$0 | \$0 | \$0 |
| Structural Engineering | \$2,700 | \$4,000 | \$5,000 | \$500 | \$3,000 | \$15,200 |
| Geotechnical Engineering | \$0 | \$13,000 | \$0 | \$0 | \$0 | \$13,000 |
| Mech/Elec/ Plumbing | \$2,400 | \$17,000 | \$26,000 | \$3,000 | \$14,400 | \$62,800 |
| Cost Estimating | \$3,220 | \$0 | \$0 | \$0 | \$0 | \$3,220 |
| <i>Total by Phase</i> | \$17,820 | \$58,000 | \$65,000 | \$12,500 | \$56,400 | |
| Phase 1 Total | \$17,820 | | | | Phase II Total | \$191,900 |
| | | | | Total Project Fee - Phases I and II | | \$209,720 |

| Cross Consulting Engineers - Design Bid Build | | | | | | |
|---|------------------|--------------------|------------------------|-------------------------------------|-----------------------|-------------------------------------|
| Service | Phase I Services | Phase II Services | | | | Total Phase I & Phase II by service |
| | Schematic Design | Design Development | Construction Documents | Bidding | Construction Admin | |
| Architectural Design | \$11,000 | \$3,200 | \$10,000 | \$2,000 | \$10,000 | \$36,200 |
| Civil (Site) Engineering | \$3,500 | \$10,000 | \$2,000 | \$500 | \$3,000 | \$19,000 |
| Wastewater Engineering | \$0 | \$2,800 | \$2,800 | \$0 | \$1,200 | \$6,800 |
| Principal Review | \$1,900 | \$1,900 | \$0 | \$0 | \$3,800 | \$7,600 |
| Landscape Architecture | \$0 | \$0 | \$0 | \$0 | \$0 | \$0 |
| Structural Engineering | \$1,650 | \$2,200 | \$4,950 | \$0 | \$1,650 | \$10,450 |
| Geotechnical Engineering | \$0 | \$18,469 | \$0 | \$0 | \$0 | \$18,469 |
| Mech/Elec/ Plumbing | \$1,650 | \$19,250 | \$24,750 | \$1,100 | \$6,050 | \$52,800 |
| Cost Estimating | \$0 | \$0 | \$0 | \$0 | \$0 | \$0 |
| <i>Total by Phase</i> | \$19,700 | \$57,819 | \$44,500 | \$3,600 | \$25,700 | \$151,319 |
| Phase 1 Total | \$19,700 | | | | Phase II Total | \$131,619 |
| | | | | Total Project Fee - Phases I and II | | \$151,319 |

*Phase II Total does not add up correctly in their proposal. Shows a difference of \$1,650

| Scott + Partners - Design Bid Build | | | | | | |
|-------------------------------------|------------------|--------------------|------------------------|-------------------------------------|-----------------------|-------------------------------------|
| Service | Phase I Services | Phase II Services | | | | Total Phase I & Phase II by service |
| | Schematic Design | Design Development | Construction Documents | Bidding | Construction Admin | |
| Architectural Design | \$7,440 | \$51,333 | \$33,923 | \$7,900 | \$59,780 | \$160,376 |
| Civil (Site) Engineering | \$4,000 | \$23,500 | \$6,500 | \$1,000 | \$8,000 | \$43,000 |
| Landscape Architecture | \$0 | \$2,225 | \$2,480 | \$0 | \$805 | \$5,510 |
| Structural Engineering | \$1,800 | \$4,500 | \$9,500 | \$500 | \$3,500 | \$19,800 |
| Geotechnical Engineering | \$0 | \$17,700 | \$0 | \$0 | \$0 | \$17,700 |
| Mech/Elec/ Plumbing | \$4,000 | \$16,000 | \$17,500 | \$1,500 | \$8,500 | \$47,500 |
| Cost Estimating | \$2,760 | \$3,850 | \$2,250 | \$0 | \$0 | \$8,860 |
| <i>Total by Phase</i> | \$20,000 | \$119,108 | \$72,153 | \$10,900 | \$80,585 | |
| Phase 1 Total | \$20,000 | | | | Phase II Total | \$282,746 |
| | | | | Total Project Fee - Phases I and II | | \$302,746 |

| Wiemann Lamphere Architects - Design Bid Build | | | | | | |
|--|------------------|--------------------|------------------------|-------------------------------------|-----------------------|-------------------------------------|
| Service | Phase I Services | Phase II Services | | | | Total Phase I & Phase II by service |
| | Schematic Design | Design Development | Construction Documents | Bidding | Construction Admin | |
| Architectural Design | \$12,000 | \$27,000 | \$52,000 | \$6,500 | \$32,500 | \$130,000 |
| Civil (Site) Engineering | \$4,500 | \$16,000 | \$6,500 | \$1,000 | \$8,000 | \$36,000 |
| Landscape Architecture | \$0 | \$5,085 | \$2,480 | \$0 | \$805 | \$8,370 |
| Structural Engineering | \$0 | \$3,500 | \$4,500 | \$250 | \$1,250 | \$9,500 |
| Geotechnical Engineering | \$0 | \$0 | \$0 | \$0 | \$0 | \$0 |
| Mech Engineering | \$0 | \$2,250 | \$10,050 | \$375 | \$2,250 | \$14,925 |
| Electrical Engineering | \$0 | \$3,700 | \$4,500 | \$250 | \$1,500 | \$9,950 |
| Cost Estimating | \$3,360 | \$0 | \$0 | \$0 | \$0 | \$3,360 |
| <i>Total by Phase</i> | \$19,860 | \$57,535 | \$80,030 | \$8,375 | \$46,305 | |
| Phase 1 Total | \$19,860 | | | | Phase II Total | \$192,245 |
| | | | | Total Project Fee - Phases I and II | | \$212,105 |

| | Cross Consulting | | | Wiemann |
|--|------------------|------------------|------------------|------------------|
| | AES Northeast | Engineers | Scott + Partners | Lamphere |
| Base Price (Total Project Fee): | \$209,720 | \$151,319 | \$302,746 | \$212,105 |
| Sum of reconciliations below: | \$6,940 | \$10,230 | \$0 | \$23,390 |
| Reconciled total project fee: | \$216,660 | \$161,549 | \$302,746 | \$235,495 |
| Boundary and topo survey | Included | Unknown | Unknown | \$7,000 |
| Geotechnical Engineering | Included | Included | Included | \$16,390 |
| Landscape Architect | \$6,940 | \$6,940 | Included | Included |
| Cost Estimating | Included | \$3,290 | Included | Included |

**Costs associated with reconciled expenses were determined by averaging competing proposal costs*